JOINT OPERATIONAL PROGRAMME BLACK SEA BASIN 2014-2020

Annex 5: Control check-list

Expenditure and revenue verification

# Template of control check-list

|  |
| --- |
| **Audit firm/Public officer organisation responsible for issuing the expenditure and revenue verification report:** |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Project Code:** | | |
| **Project Title:** | | |
| **Reporting period:** from*dd Month yyyy*to*dd Month yyyy* | | |
| **Name of the Lead Beneficiary/Beneficiary:** | | |
| **Role of the beneficiary in the project:** | **Lead beneficiary** | **Project Beneficiary** |
|  | | |
| **Request for examination:** | **Date of request for examination:**  *dd Month yyyy* | |
| **General remarks of the Controller (auditor/public officer) (if any):** | | |

|  |
| --- |
|  |
| **Date:** |
| **Name of the Controller (auditor/public officer(s)[[1]](#footnote-1):** |
| **Signature(s):** |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| 1. SUMMARY OF AMOUNTS AND TYPE OF VERIFICATION | |
| Expenditure declared by the Lead Beneficiary/Beneficiary | EUR <x,xxx.xx> |
| Expenditure verified by the Controller | EUR <x,xxx.xx>  Expenditure Coverage Ratio <xx.xx%> |
| Expenditure complying with requirements set in the expenditure verification procedures | EUR <x,xxx.xx> |
| Expenditure not complying with requirements set in the expenditure verification procedures | EUR <x,xxx.xx> |
| Type of the verification: | Only desk-based check  Includes on-the-spot verification  *(\*at least one of the two verifications carried out for the interim and final report shall be an on-the-spot)* |
| On-the-spot verification(s) | Date: *dd Month yyyy*  Place(s):  premises of the Lead Beneficiary/Beneficiary<indicate address>  place of project outputs <indicate address>  other (please indicate)  <indicate address> |
| Expenditure verified on-the-spot: | EUR <x,xxx.xx> |
| Format in which documents were made available | original (including electronic)  copies (including electronic) |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| FORMAL CHECKS | | |
| **Checks** | **Yes/No**  **N.A.** | **Comments** |
| 1. Application Form and Budget in force, as annexes to the Grant Contract are available, electronically or paper based |  |  |
| 1. Grant Contract signed by both parties (MA and Lead Beneficiary) is available, electronically or paper based |  |  |
| 1. Partnership Agreements signed by all project beneficiaries are available, electronically or paper based |  |  |
| 1. Narrative report of the Lead Beneficiary/Beneficiary concerning the activities undertaken during the reporting period is available |  |  |
| 1. Addendum of any modification of the Grant Contract is available |  |  |
| 1. Financial report of the Lead Beneficiary/Beneficiary is available |  |  |
| 1. The reports issued by the Lead Beneficiary/Beneficiary are developed in English (If any section contains explanations in other language then English, the text should be revised). |  |  |
| 1. The global project budget in force is available |  |  |
| 1. The individual budget in force for the Lead Beneficiary/Beneficiary is available |  |  |
| 1. General Declaration of the Lead Beneficiary/Beneficiary is available in original, signed by the authorised person of the project partner’s institution |  |  |
| 1. Additional documents and clarifications were requested during the control procedure (please describe) |  |  |
| 1. In the eMS List of Expenditures all the sections are filled in according to the reporting rules (*The Invoice number and date; Payment date; Description of activity/expenditure; Contract; Type of procurement)* and payment proofing documents are attached |  |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| GENERAL ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA | | |
| **Checks** | **Yes/No**  **N.A.** | **Comments** |
| 1. All expenses have been actually incurred and paid by the Lead Beneficiary/Beneficiary, and they can be verified on the basis of adequate original supporting documents |  |  |
| 1. All expenses are directly related to the project, necessary for its implementation, and they are in accordance with the approved budget |  |  |
| 1. All expenses have been **incurred**[[2]](#footnote-2) **and paid** between the date of start of the project and the end date of the relevant reporting period, or end of implementation period, with the following exceptions:  * costs for studies and documentation for projects including an infrastructure component, required during the evaluation stage (feasibility studies) which may be incurred after the approval date of the Programme (18 December 2015); * expenditure verification and final evaluation of the project, which may be incurred after the implementation period of the project and paid before the submission of the final report |  |  |
| 1. All expenses have been incurred in the Programme eligible area[[3]](#footnote-3) |  |  |
| 1. Expenses outside programme area are declared accordingly (*„Expenditure Outside (The Union Part Of) The Programme Area*” section from the list of expenditure is ticked, if the case) |  |  |
| 1. Expenses outside programme area are approved in the project budget as such |  |  |
| 1. Any recoverable VAT has been deducted from the amount of declared expenditure for all relevant items |  |  |
| 1. Any ineligible expenditure (in accordance with the provisions of Article 8.5 of the Grant contract), including contributions in kind has been excluded from the declared expenditure. |  |  |
| 1. Expenses are identifiable and verifiable and accounted in accordance with national accounting standards |  |  |
| 1. Expenses are reasonable, justified and in accordance with the principles of sound financial management, in particular regarding economy and efficiency |  |  |
| 1. Expenses comply with the requirements of applicable tax, labour and social legislation |  |  |
| 1. The expenditure is reported in the original currency of the invoice/bill |  |  |
| 1. The expenses have not already been reported and claimed in the Interim Report ( applicable only for Final Report) |  |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| ALLOCATION TO ACTIVITIES AND BUDGET LINES | | |
| **Checks** | **Yes/No**  **N.A.** | **Comments** |
| 1. Expenses have been correctly allocated to the relevant work packages/ groups of activities, as set out in the approved budget[[4]](#footnote-4) |  |  |
| 1. Expenditures are linked to the Procurement section in eMS according to the requirements of reporting[[5]](#footnote-5) (applicable for External expertise and services, Equipment and Infrastructure) |  |  |
| 1. The Lead Beneficiary/Beneficiary’s budget by activities and by budget lines or sub-budget line fixed in the approved Budget have been respected |  |  |
| 1. There is a clear link between activities implemented and described in the narrative part of the report and costs incurred |  |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| ELIGIBILITY OF EXPENDITURES BY BUDGET LINES | | |
| STAFF COSTS | | |
| **Checks** | **Yes/No**  **N.A.** | **Comments** |
| 1. Declaration of number of hours worked by each staff member, is available |  |  |
| 1. Appointment Decision of project management team, signed by the legal representative of the Lead Beneficiary/Beneficiary (as the case), is available |  |  |
| 1. Employment/ Work contracts / Addenda to the employment contracts/ any similar type of contract according to national rules / designation or secondment order of civil servant for all project staff is available |  |  |
| 1. Contract/ designation or secondment order and/ or the related job description contains  * the assignment of the person for the project and its tasks within the project * start date and end date of the assignment * the person is working exclusively or partially on the project |  |  |
| 1. Payslips are available |  |  |
| 1. Monthly timesheets (required only for staff partially working on the project) are available |  |  |
| 1. Timesheets are sufficiently detailed (name of the employee, date, time and description of the daily activity) |  |  |
| 1. Timesheets are signed both by the employee and the employer representative |  |  |
| 1. The calculation of the hourly rates of the staff costs is correct. |  |  |
| 1. The staff costs is based on real costs (real gross salary proved by payslips) and real worked hours (time spent on the project proved by timesheets) |  |  |
| 1. Working time spent on the project does not exceed the normal working hours, according to the national legislation in force |  |  |
| 1. Any fringe benefits, rewards over the monthly salaries are excluded from the hourly/daily rate |  |  |
| 1. Additional charges (e.g alimony, bank monthly payments, etc) besides the social contribution charges (obligatory according to national rules) are excluded from the hourly rate |  |  |
| 1. Proof of payment of the salary is available |  |  |
| 1. Proof of payment of the social charges and taxes is available |  |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| 2. TRAVEL AND ACCOMODATION COSTS | | |
| **Checks** | **Yes/No**  **N.A.** | **Comments** |
| 1. Travel costs are directly related to the project |  |  |
| 1. Only travelling costs of the project staff or other persons taking part in the project are declared[[6]](#footnote-6) |  |  |
| 1. Travel costs of the partner employees and final beneficiaries are budgeted |  |  |
| 1. Travels are performed within the eligible area. When the travel is performed outside the eligible area of the Programme, the specific provisions in the Grant Contract are respected and the costs are approved in the budget as costs outside Programme eligible area |  |  |
| 1. Authorisations of the missions are available (if obligatory according to national/ institutional rules) |  |  |
| 1. Mission report signed by the travelling person is available (if obligatory according to national/ institutional rules – the latter shall be applied only in case national rules are not available) |  |  |
| 1. All supporting documents are available (invitation, agenda, list of participants, minutes, etc.) |  |  |
| 1. Train/bus tickets, plane tickets, boarding cards, etc. are available |  |  |
| 1. The most economical and efficient way of transport is used, in accordance with the internal procedures of the organisation |  |  |
| 1. Road time sheets in case of used of a personal vehicle, vehicle owned by the organisation or of a vehicle (used for road, water transport) purchased from the project budget or rented/leased for the project implementation (including for management activities), prepared according to national/ institutional rules (the latter shall be applied only in case national rules are not available), justifying its’ use in relation to the project activities and stating at least the distance and the total costs of the travel, is available |  |  |
| 1. If costs are directly paid by the institution, proof of payment are available |  |  |
| 1. If costs are paid by the person going on mission / an advance is paid by the institution to the person going on mission, the documents on the reimbursement of costs are available |  |  |
| 1. For staff working in public institutions as well as in units subordinated or coordinated by such institutions, the expenses with subsistence costs should comply with the national legislation in force applicable for public institutions |  |  |
| 1. For staff working in other legal entities than those mentioned in the previous category, subsistence costs do not exceed neither the costs normally paid by the Lead Beneficiary/Beneficiary according to their national rules and regulation nor the rates[[7]](#footnote-7) published by the Commission at the time of the mission: [www.ec.europa.eu/europeaid/work/procedures/index\_en.htm](http://www.ec.europa.eu/europeaid/work/procedures/index_en.htm) |  |  |
| 1. Proof of payment of subsistence costs are available |  |  |
| 1. Documents confirming payment of travel medical insurance, visas are available |  |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| 3. EXTERNAL EXPERTISE AND SERVICES | | |
| 1. **EXTERNAL EXPERTISE** | | |
| **Checks** | **Yes/No**  **N.A.** | **Comments** |
| 1. Services provided by the external experts are directly related to the project, the related activities are explicitly stated in the approved Grant Contract |  |  |
| 1. Documents on the selection of the external expert (or service company) are available |  |  |
| 1. Beneficiaries of the same project, its employees or any affiliated entity are not contracted as an external expert or a sub-contractor. |  |  |
| 1. The contract laying down the services to be provided is available |  |  |
| 1. The evidence of the work carried out by the service/works provider (studies, researches, analysis, etc.), is available |  |  |
| 1. If applicable, the deliverables respect the information and publicity requirements of the Programme |  |  |
| 1. Proof of payment is available |  |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| 1. **MEETINGS AND EVENTS** | | |
| **Checks** | **Yes/No**  **N.A.** | **Comments** |
| 1. Meetings and events are directly related to the project, the related activities are explicitly stated in the approved Grant Contract |  |  |
| 1. Documents on the selection of the service providers are available |  |  |
| 1. The contract laying down the services to be provided and the amendments to the contract, if the case, are available |  |  |
| 1. The evidence of the work carried out by the service provider is available (invitation, agenda of the meeting, list of participants, photos of the event, etc.) |  |  |
| 1. The promotional materials produced in the framework of the event respect the information and publicity requirements of the Programme |  |  |
| 1. Proof of payment is available |  |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| 1. **PROMOTION COSTS** | | |
| **Checks** | **Yes/No**  **N.A.** | **Comments** |
| 1. Promotion costs are directly related to the project and have not been declared on other budgeted lines. |  |  |
| 1. The evidence of the work carried out by the service provider is available (brochures, project website, etc.) |  |  |
| 1. According to this evidence, the information and publicity requirements of the Programme are respected |  |  |
| 1. Proof of payment is available |  |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| 4. EQUIPMENT | | |
| **Checks** | **Yes/No**  **N.A.** | **Comments** |
| 1. The equipment purchased is necessary for the project implementation and is foreseen in the approved Grant Contract |  |  |
| 1. The equipment is used for project implementation |  |  |
| 1. Documents on the selection of the suppliers are available |  |  |
| 1. The contract laying down the purchase of equipment in the framework of the project and the amendments to the contract, if the case, are available |  |  |
| 1. The evidence of the purchase of equipment is available (e.g. inventory of the equipment purchased) |  |  |
| 1. Proof of payment is available |  |  |
| 1. Proof of delivery (e.g handover minute/note) and putting into operation (minute/note), is available |  |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| 5. INFRASTRUCTURE AND WORKS | | |
| **Checks** | **Yes/No**  **N.A.** | **Comments** |
| 1. The building permit is issued on behalf of the Lead Beneficiary/Beneficiary |  |  |
| 1. Handover of the site and floor plan of the investment terminals containing topographic positions is dated, signed (with the name mentioned in the clear) and stamped by all persons mentioned in program tracking and quality control work |  |  |
| 1. The program tracking and quality control work is covered by the relevant public supervising body, signed by the legal representative / project's technical designer and contractor |  |  |
| 1. Date of issue of commencement order of work predates any analysis bulletins, the minutes of the hidden works and minutes on determined phases |  |  |
| 1. Quality reception minutes, minutes for hidden works and decisive phases are developed in accordance with and quality control of works from the technical project, are signed and stamped by all participants to its elaboration |  |  |
| 1. Payment statements of works and centralized payment statements are signed with the name mentioned in clear and dated by the legal representative / technical representative, the tutor / supervisor inspector (with attesting certificate) and contractor |  |  |
| 1. The total amount of payment statements for work matches the value of the centralized work situation |  |  |
| 1. Work execution is in accordance with the time schedule of works |  |  |
| 1. Type and quantities of works performed and reflected in the payment statements are found on site |  |  |
| 1. Unit prices from payment situations are less than or equal to those from the winning bid unit prices which is attached to the contract execution |  |  |
| 1. Calculations for each category of works (quantity, unit price and value) are correct |  |  |
| 1. Works from payment situations are executed according to the time schedule and don’t exceed the contracted budget |  |  |
| **In case of costs for studies and documentation for projects including an infrastructure component, which were required during the evaluation stage (feasibility studies)** | | |
| 13. They are incurred after the approval date of the Programme (18 December 2015). |  |  |
| 14. They are limited to studies and documentation for projects including an infrastructure component, which were required during the evaluation stage (feasibility studies) |  |  |
| 15. Proof of payment is available |  |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| 6. OFFICE AND ADMINISTRATION COSTS | | |
| **Checks** | **Yes/No**  **N.A.** | **Comments** |
| 1. No office and administration costs are declared under any other budget line |  |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| PUBLIC PROCUREMENT | | |
| **Checks** | **Yes/No**  **N.A.** | **Comments** |
| 1. The procedure applied for the procurement of services, equipment or investments/infrastructure is adequate according to the Grant Contract, national and community rules |  |  |
| 1. Public procurements are documented and the supporting documents are scanned and uploaded in eMS in the section Supplementary Information/Procurement (e.g. award criteria, requests for offers, offers, reports from evaluation committee, contracts are available) |  |  |
| 1. There is no suspicion that the procedure for awarding the contracts by the Lead Beneficiary/Beneficiary is vitiated by conflict of interests (in the limit of the information detained). |  |  |
| 1. There is no (sub)contracting services/supplies/works to the staff of the Lead Beneficiary / Beneficiary |  |  |
| 1. There is no (sub)contracting services/supplies/works to the other beneficiaries’ staff |  |  |
| 1. There is no other suspicion than the ones listed above. |  |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| STATE AID | | |
| **Checks** | **Yes/No**  **N.A.** | **Comments** |
| 1. There are no suspicions that in accordance with Article 12.3 of the ENI CBC Implementing Rules, aid granted to this project does not comply with the applicable Union rules on State aid within the meaning of Article 107 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union and the conditions stipulated in the grant contract |  |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| REVENUES | | |
| **Checks** | **Yes/No**  **N.A.** | **Comments** |
| 1. The Lead Beneficiary/Beneficiary reports revenues |  |  |
| 1. The revenues are real and adequately recorded |  |  |
| 1. At the final report, there is no surplus of receipts over costs (non-profit) |  |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| INFORMATION AND PUBLICITY | | |
| **Checks** | **Yes/No**  **N.A.** | **Comments** |
| 1. The requirements of programme Communication & Visibility Manual and the Grant Contract are respected |  |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| AUDIT TRAIL AND ACCOUNTING SYSTEM | | |
| **Checks** | **Yes/No**  **N.A.** | **Comments** |
| 1. Specific accounting codes or other transparent methods are used for the project in the accounting system which allow the identification of costs allocated to the project |  |  |
| 1. Computerised list of project expenditure and revenue can be obtained from the accounting system (except for staff and administrative costs) |  |  |
| 1. The expenditure declared corresponds to the accounting records, reconciliation schemes and supporting documents held by the Lead Beneficiary/Beneficiary |  |  |

1. Name of the person(s) who performed the verification [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. “Costs relating to services and works shall relate to activities performed during the implementation period” (article 48 of ENI CBC IR) [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. Expenditure(s) outside the eligible area is not a reason for declaring those expenditure(s) ineligible, unless they are not foreseen in the budget in force at the date of submission of the report. The Controller has to verify also the expenditure outside the eligible area and shall include in the comment box the total amount of the respective expenditure. The check regarding the observance of the maximum percentage (15%) allowed at project level will be made at the final report by JTS. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. In principle, staff costs, irrespective of the project activity (Work Package in eMS) are linked to, have to be reported under the Work Package/Group of Activities Management. If budgeted under other Group of Activities (not Management), as to comply with the provisions of the national legislation, or with the organisations’ internal rules, they shall be reported under the respective Group of Activities. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. Project Implementation Manual, Annex 5 - Guide on reporting into the eMS, section 2.7 and section 4.3.2. [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. The controller shall check that costs of experts, trainers, etc. other persons providing services for project activities (based on a service contract) to the beneficiary, are not reported under this budget line. They should be reported under External expertise budget line. [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. These rates, so-called per diems, indicate the maximum amount of allowance per night in accordance to EC rules. They cannot be understood as the amount to be paid to the person. In any case, the national limits prevail if they are lower [↑](#footnote-ref-7)